

फोन/Phone : 91-22-6656 4071
फैक्स/Fax : 91-22-2261 7721
ई मेल/e-mail : em@mbptmail.com



मुंबई पोर्ट ट्रस्ट
Mumbai Port Trust



संपदा अनुभाग, B/6-4(RIA)
तिसरा माला, विजयदीप,
शूरजी वल्लभदास मार्ग, बॉलार्ड इस्टेट,
मुंबई - 400 001.

Estate Division,
3rd floor, Vijaydeep,
S.V. Marg, Ballard Estate,
Mumbai - 400 001.

No. EM/AS (G)/RTI/

To,
Shri Param Patel
Patel Studio,
Limda Choke Bardoli,
Near Bardoli Police Station,
Surat. Pin: 394601.
State: Gujarat.



online application received on
21/11/19 vide No. 7/36
21/11/19

By Registered A.D

S.E. - S.D.K./Roads
2
CPIO

Sir,

Sub: Your application dated 16.12.2018 under
Right to Information Act 2005, received in
this Division on-line on 16.12.2018 and
03.01.2019 from CPIO, Shri. N. G. Mirajkar.

~~प्लेस~~
09/11/19

With reference to your application under RTI Act referred above, it is to state that as per the guidelines for Public Authorities under RTI Act 2005, it is not required to create information, or to interpret information, or to solve problems raised by the applicant or to furnish replies to hypothetical questions.

The information sought by you vide your subject application dated 16.12.2018 may be held by another CPIO of MbPT i.e. Shri S. B. Lagwankar, Suptdg. Engineer to whom the application is already transferred on-line on 28/12/2018 for further necessary action in the matter.

If you are aggrieved by the reply/ decision, you may prefer an appeal within 30 days from receipt of this reply to the Appellate Authority i.e.

Smt. S. G. Patwardhan,
Sr. Deputy Secretary (GAD) & Appellate Authority,
Mumbai Port Trust, Port House, 2nd Floor,
S. V. Marg, Mumbai 400 001.
E-mail id: spatwardhan@mbptmail.com
Tel No. 66564047.

Yours faithfully,

(Shri H. P. Kulkarni)

Central Public Information Officer
& Estate Manager- (I/C)
Tel.No.022-66564452

- No. /- do- 3847
c.c. to Shri. S. B. Lagwankar, CPIO and Suptdg Engineer. CE's Department

- For information,

(Shri H. P. Kulkarni)
CPIO & Estate Manager- (I/C)
Tel.No.022-66564452

7 JAN 2019

RTI REQUEST DETAILS (आरटीआई अनुरोध विवरण)

B/6-4(RTA)
S.B. RAY/CPZ

Registration Number (पंजीकरण संख्या) :	MPTRS/R/2018/50072/1	Date of Receipt (प्राप्ति की तारीख) :	16/12/2018
Type of Receipt (रसीद का प्रकार) :	Online Receipt	Language of Request (अनुरोध की भाषा) :	English
Name (नाम) :	param patel	Gender (लिंग) :	Male
Address (पता) :	PATEL STUDIO, LIMDA CHOKE BARDOLI, Near bardoli police station, SURAT, Pin:394601		
State (राज्य) :	Gujarat	Country (देश) :	India
Phone Number (फोन नंबर) :	Details not provided	Mobile Number (मोबाईल नंबर) :	+91-8141006997
Email-ID (ईमेल-आईडी) :	parampatel69@gmail.com		
Status (स्थिति)(Rural/Urban) :	Rural	Education Status :	Graduate
Is Requester Below Poverty Line ? (क्या आवेदक गरीबी रेखा से नीचे का है?) :	No	Citizenship Status (नागरिकता) :	Indian
Amount Paid (राशि का भुगतान) :	0 (Received by Mumbai Port Trust) (original recipient)	Mode of Payment (भुगतान का प्रकार) :	Payment Gateway
Request Pertains to (अनुरोध निम्नलिखित संबंधित है) :	S.B. Lagwankar		
Information Sought (जानकारी मांगी) :	Respected Sir/madam,		

मुख्य अभियंता का कार्यालय
Chief Engineer's Office
आ. र. संख्या. B/6-4(RTA)
दिनांक 02 JAN 2019
मुंबई पोर्ट ट्रस्ट
MUMBAI PORT TRUST
संकेत सं. / Inward No. 7136

2/1/19
Adv-Planning
Dy. Commr (Designs)

I am Param Patel architecture student from Raman Bhakta School of Architecture(college) Surat Gujarat. I am in my 10th currently doing my thesis. I am designing a Symphony orchestra Concert Hall along with western classical music Academy for my thesis.

Note: all this is hypothetical and not real.

Academically for the thesis, we need to identify a site on paper. The design will be best in class, with foreign standard which will not compromise any aspect of Western classical music. it is a need of the hour to build a Symphony orchestra Concert Hall in India which Indian lacks. I am proposing it in Mumbai keeping in mind the high demand the long queue for concert of Zubin Mehta in Mumbai. Mumbai has a Bollywood background too. For the justification and a rough idea for what it will look like I am sending a few data from my research.

I have identified a land near princess Dock in Mumbai port trust to propose my in my college. There are three main factors to keep in mind for choosing the site.

The information is sought for research project. } 'A'
 Whether RTI can be used for such purpose?
 A decision on this issue is enclosed at 'A' }

However the proposals are now uploaded } 'B'
 on our website. It may download the
 same. For any other information

he may discuss with any the concerned
 officer during the working hours

(Jshd) 3/11/19

Dy. (E Design)

Is the information to be provided to the
~~same~~ applicant voluminous?

3
 4-1-19

Adv. Planning

Yes.

(Deny)

3/11/19

Since the information sought is unrelated to transparency & accountability in the functioning of public authorities & eradication of corruption, as also very voluminous, it is regretted the same cannot be provided. (Case law cited by Adv. Planning is at Annexure A)

3/11/19

AI

Information- Exempted

S. No.	Questions	Reply	Court/CIC decision
A	<u>Information to be denied under section 7(9)</u>		
1.	Whether voluminous information to be provided?	<p align="center">No</p> <p>(Inspection should be given if document is available with PIO)</p>	<p>Central Board of Secondary Education and Anr. v. Aditya Bandopadhyay and Ors. CIVIL APPEAL NO.6454 OF 2011, Supreme Court. SLP [C] No.7526/2009, Dated 09.08.2011.</p> <p>http://jmi.ac.in/upload/menuupload/rti_SC_CBSE.pdf</p> <p>Indiscriminate and impractical demands or directions under RTI Act for disclosure of all and sundry information (unrelated to transparency and accountability in the functioning of public authorities and eradication of corruption) would be counter-productive as it will adversely affect the efficiency of the administration and result in the executive getting bogged down with the non-productive work of collecting and furnishing information. The Act should not be allowed to be misused or abused, to become a tool to obstruct the national development and integration, or to destroy the peace, tranquility and harmony among its citizens. The nation does not want a scenario where 75% of the staff of public authorities spends 75% of their time in collecting and furnishing information to applicants instead of discharging their regular duties. The threat of penalties under the RTI Act and the pressure of the authorities under the RTI Act should not lead to employees of a public authorities prioritizing 'information furnishing', at the cost of their normal and regular duties.</p>

Compiled by Corporate Affairs

Dycc(Designs) 2/21119

Information- Exempted

2.	Information regarding 63 LPG trucks, mileage details and amount paid in each case, month wise, for the period 01.01.2009 to 30.5.2013 sought from IOCL.	No	<p>M Sushil Kumar v. IOCL: CIC/SS/A/2013/002695/SH</p> <p>Dated 30.10.2014.</p> <p>http://www.rti.india.gov.in/cic_decisions/CIC SS A 2013 002695 SH M 141840.pdf</p> <p>Being voluminous information, it was denied under 7(9) of the RTI Act, 2005.</p>
3.	The appellant sought verification of domestic/commercial LPG connections in respect of two gas agencies, Number of connections cancelled/locked, and details of consumers booked LPG cylinders during April 2005 to November 2011 for home delivery.	No	<p>Girish Nautiyal vs IOCL: CIC/LS/A/2013/001174/SS, Dated 27.01.2014.</p> <p>http://rti.india.gov.in/cic_decisions/CIC LS A 2013 001174 SS M 123883.pdf</p> <p>Information denied on the grounds of voluminous information under the provisions of Section 7(9) of the RTI Act. However, inspection of documents should be allowed.</p>
4.	<p>The Applicant filed 4 application seeking following information:-</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The number of Class A and Class B officers who had not been transferred as per the Company's transfer policy. • The number of Doctors who had been appointed in the Company under physically challenged quota since 1995. • Copies of rules and regulations for punishment of dealers of LPG and 	No	<p>Nitesh Kumar Tripathi Vs Ministry of Youth Affairs & Sports</p> <p>CIC/LS/A/2012/000938 Dated 14.03.13</p> <p>http://rti.india.gov.in/cic_decisions/CIC LS A 2012 001032 M 107247.pdf</p> <p>Demand for vague and omnibus information does not serve any purpose. Besides, applicant has also to keep in mind that collection, collation and transmission of information takes time and impinges on resources of the public authority.</p>

1. The new international Cruise terminal which is being built.
2. Development of eastern riverfront for residential, commercial, recreational activities over 500ha of Mumbai Port Trust land by the architectural firm HCP.
3. New Goa Mumbai Cruise.

The project will attract The Cruise passenger when is other foreign artist to perform in India. design can be so iconic that it will be come the highlight for the city. The approximate land area required is 15000 to 20000 meter square.

Again all this is hypothetical.

Following are the information I am seeking For my thesis project:

- 1)I want to know from the Mumbai Port Trust that which land is not under the HCPs (architectural firm designing the eastern Waterfront) Eastern Waterfront development master plan as well as not being majorly used by MbPT so I can use for my thesis.
- 2)List of land parcel of MbPT not being majorly used by MbPT.
- 3)Manual/CAD drawing/Picture demarking the above required area.
- 4)I have uploaded a file showing an area which I have identified for my thesis project,my question is is the demarked land area which I have uploaded being majorly used by Mbpt.
- 5)How many and where are the Entry and exits points are there in MbPT near Princess and Victoria dock
- 6)Basic details/draft of HCPs Waterfront development master plan which shows the land use category like commercial residential open spaces etc.

I can assure you that the data obtained will be used purely for academic purpose .

Thanking you. Wailing for an early reply.

Original RTI Text (मूल आरटीआई पाठ):

Respected Sir/madam,

I am Param Patel architecture student from Raman Bhakta School of Architecture(college) Surat Gujarat. I am in my 10th currently doing my thesis. I am designing a Symphony orchestra Concert Hall along with western classical music Academy for my thesis.

Note: all this is hypothetical and not real.

compromise any aspect of Western classical music. it is a need of the hour to build a Symphony orchestra Concert Hall in India which Indian lacks. I am proposing it in Mumbai keeping in mind the high demand the long queue for concert of Zubin Mehta in Mumbai. Mumbai has a Bollywood background too. For the justification and a rough idea for what it will look like I am sending a few data from my research.

I have identified a land near princess Dock in Mumbai port trust to propose my in my college. There are three main factors to keep in mind for choosing the site.

1. The new international Cruise terminal which is being built.
2. Development of eastern riverfront for residential, commercial, recreational activities over 500ha of Mumbai Port Trust land by the architectural firm HCP.
3. New Goa Mumbai Cruise.

The project will attract The Cruise passenger when is other foreign artist to perform in India. design can be so iconic that it will be come the highlight for the city. The approximate land area required is 15000 to 20000 meter square.

Again all this is hypothetical.

Following are the information I am seeking For my thesis project:

- 1)I want to know from the Mumbai Port Trust that which land is not under the HCPs (architectural firm designing the eastern Waterfront) Eastern Waterfront development master plan as well as not being majorly used by MbPT so I can use for my thesis.
- 2)List of land parcel of MbPT not being majorly used by MbPT.
- 3)Manual/CAD drawing/Picture demarking the above required area.
- 4)I have uploaded a file showing an area which I have identified for my thesis project,my question is is the demarked land area which I have uploaded being majorly used by Mbpt.
- 5)How many and where are the Entry and exits points are there in MbPT near Princess and Victoria dock
- 6)Basic details/draft of HCPs Waterfront development master plan which shows the land use category like commercial residential open spaces etc.

I can assure you that the data obtained will be used purely for academic purpose .

Thanking you. Waiting for an early reply.

SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER
Port House,
Shoorji Vallabhdas Marg,
Ballard Estate,
Mumbai - 400 001.
Tel. No. : 6656 4040
Fax No. : 2261 6804
Email : sblagwankar@
mbptmail.com
Website : mumbaiport.gov.in

मुंबई पोर्ट ट्रस्ट
MUMBAI PORT TRUST
ब्रह्मपूर अतिथिगिरी विभाग
CIVIL ENGINEERING DEPARTMENT



अधिकारक अतिथिता
पोर्ट भवन
शुद्धी पल्लभदास मार्ग
बेलाड इस्टेट
मुंबई 400 001.
दूरध्वनी क्र.: 6656 4040
फॅक्स क्र.: 2261 6804
ईमेल : sblagwankar@
mbptmail.com
वेबसाईट : mumbaiport.gov.in

No. CE.B/6-4(RIA)/ 7876

Date : _____

11 JAN 2019

To,
Shri Param Patel,
Patel Studio,
Limda Choke Bardoli,
Near Bardoli Police Station,
Surat, Pin – 394601,
Gujarat, India.

Sub :- Information sought under RTI Act 2005.

Ref :- Your application dated 16.12.2018 received in this office
on 02.01.2019.

.....

With reference to above, the information sought by you is as under:

Sr. No.	RTI Queries	Answers.
1	Which land is not under the HCP's (architectural firm designing the Eastern Waterfront) Eastern Waterfront Development Master Plan as well as not being majorly used by MbPT, so I can use for my thesis.	Reports and Plans are published on MbPT website.
2	List of land parcel of MbPT not being majorly used by MbPT.	This is huge data which may not be given
3	Manual/ CAD Drawings/ Picture demarking the above required area.	The Auto Cad drawings are given to applicant personally.
4	I have uploaded a file showing an area which I have identified for my thesis project---- "Is demarked land area which has been uploaded, being used by MbPT.	This is not a question.
5	How many and where are the Entry and Exits points are there in MbPT near Princess and Victoria Dock.	The respective plans are uploaded on MbPT website.
6	Basic details/ Draft of HCP's Waterfront Development Master Plan which shows the land use category like commercial, residential open spaces etc.	Master Plan is uploaded on MbPT website, www.mumbaiport.gov.in

2. If you are not satisfied with the information given as above, you may prefer an appeal to the Mrs. S.G. Patwardhan, Sr. Dy. Secretary, GAD and First Appellate Authority, Mumbai Port Trust, 2nd Floor, Port Bhavan, Shoorji Vallabhdas Marg, Fort, Ballard Estate, Mumbai - 400 001, within 30 days.

D. A. : Nil.

sel/-
(S. B. LAGWANKAR)
SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER, RRY
&
CENTRAL PUBLIC INFORMATION OFFICER
MUMBAI PORT TRUST
Mob. No. 9869575395

c.c. to the Shri H.P. Kulkarni, CPIO & Estate Manager(I/c)
Ref.: No. EM/AS(G)/RTI/3847 dated 07.01.2018.

D. A. : Nil.

Handwritten signature
(S. B. LAGWANKAR)
SUPERINTENDING ENGINEER, RRY
&
CENTRAL PUBLIC INFORMATION OFFICER
MUMBAI PORT TRUST
de